Digital Image, 2011. The Ida M. Tarbell Collection, 1890-1944, Allegheny College/Pelletier Library.

Chapter V

II

Dear Miss Tarbell: I am not sure whether the theme of this chapter is "Peopling the Nation" or "Peopling the Countryside." If it is the former (as I think you intend), I hope you will include much more material on immigration. My volume leaves the subject in its larger aspects to you. I hope you will give the total number of immigrants at different years and show that the older tide from Western Europe was giving way to a newer one from South & Eastern Europe. (Such books as R. L. Faris, Immigration Restriction, and H. P. Fairchild, Immigration, are good on this subject). As your chapter stands at present, one gets the impression that most of the immigrants avoided the cities for the farming regions, and that this held true throughout the period. (The books referred to also discuss the various laws to regulate and restrict immigration from Europe). and [redacted])

May I make one other suggestion? Since the central theme of your volume is "nationalization," you might well close your chapter by showing how the Great West was organized into states until there was a continuous block of them stretching from coast to coast. By 1848 all the states had been admitted into the Union but Okla, N. Mexico and Utah. (You can find the admission dates conveniently in the World Almanac).

A. M. S.

If you should wish to reduce the size of the chapter, the material on Florida might be condensed.

Later: In many ways it would seem more logical to have the chapter on "Peopling the Nation" come earlier in the volume, perhaps following Chap. I. This would clear the way for a more uniform sequence of chapters on organizing the various fields of business, agriculture & labor

Digital Image, 2011. The Ida M. Tarbell Collection, 1890-1944, Allegheny College Pelletier Library.

Chapter VI

Dear Miss Tarbell:

In your discussion of the underlying economic causes of agrarian discontent, you have omitted two factors which I think should be included: (1) high interest rates on borrowed money; and (2) the exactions of the middlemen. A discussion of the latter would help your readers to understand why the Alliances undertook coöperative enterprises. The former helps to explain the subtreasury scheme.

I think you should make a clearer distinction between the plight of the Southern farmers and that of the Northern farmers. Some of the difficulties of each group were peculiar to the particular section and the type of agriculture. Thus, the crop-lien system was special to the South; thus, also, the conflict in the South between the white masses of the Tillman type and the survivors of the old landed gentry. This Southern background is briefly alluded to in The Rise of the City, 6-8, 18-20. Hicks, The Populist Movement, gives a detailed treatment.

The chapter as a whole gives the impression that the Alliance movement in its early stages was wholly a Southern affair. It would be desirable to parallel your account of Southern developments with a similar account of Northern developments. Hicks (pages 97 ff) gives the essential facts, beginning with the formation of the Northern Farmers' Alliance in 1877. Most students have regarded the Alliance movement in the West as more important than that in the South. As you make clear, the dynamic leaders came from Kansas & Minnesota.

A.M.S

Chapter VII

Dear Miss Tarbell:

There are two omissions in this chapter which you can easily rectify.

1. You fail to state clearly the outcome of the eight-hour movement in 1886. The discussion is left somewhat hanging in the air. The exact results are summarized in J.R. Commons, History of Labour in the U.S., II, 384-385. Commons shows that nearly 200 000 men obtained shorter hours.

2. In your discussion of the Knights of Labor you say nothing about their cooperative enterprises. Commons treats this phase in Vol. II, 430-438. Your readers will be interested because you have already discussed the cooperative activities of the Farmers' Alliances.

There is perhaps some needless duplication between your treatment of the origins of the Knights and Prof. Nevins's discussion (pp. 393-394).

A. M. S.

The Farmer in their political revolt
& the Cadres inflamed in
Knottcrack &
by Knot of Color.

Digital Image, 2011. The Ida M. Tarbell Collection, 1890-1944, Allegheny College Pelletier Library.

Chapter IX

IV

Dear Miss Tarbell:

I wonder if you would be willing to reconsider the material in this chapter and its relation to the rest of the book. The long (and interesting) account of the steel industry and the shorter accounts of the sugar and other trusts would seem to follow logically after Chap. III "The Industrial Trust." oh

The tariff discussion might be separated from the story of economic development in somewhat the way you do in The Tariff in Our Times, and be given a chapter to itself. You could enlarge the treatment by carrying the story thro' the McKinley Tariff of 1890. At present, the tariff is left hanging in the air. (Another reason for including the McKinley Act is that on p. 293 + 294 you allude to it altho' you haven't yet told about its having been passed.) You also give an account of the Wilson-Gorman Act in Chap. X without having first told your readers about the McKinley Act.) (Your discussion of the McKinley bill is in Chap. XI, pp 333-334, where I think it serves no particularly useful purpose.)

A M S.

Digital Image, 2011. The Ida M. Tarbell Collection, 1890-1944, Allegheny College Pelletier Library.

Chapter X

Dear Miss Tarbell:

It seems to me that your account of the Cotton trust, and your account of the whisky trust prior to the investigation of 1888, should come earlier in the book. It might be included in the chapter dealing with the Steel industry etc, which (as I have suggested in my comment on Chap. II) should follow Chapter III.

In regard to the tariff of 1894, I think that you should give a fuller statement of its provisions since this is your first mention of it. An especially interesting feature, of course, was the provision for an income tax. If you take ~~the income tax~~ it up later, it might be referred to here only briefly. (Later: I have found your fuller treatment in Chap. XI, pp. 334-336. I still think it would be better to have one treatment of the matter instead of two. It is a little confusing to have a partial statement first, with followed many pages later by a more complete discussion.)

AMS

Digital Image, 2011. The Ida M. Tarbell Collection, 1890-1944, Allegheny College Pelletier Library.

Chapter XII.

The interesting and novel theme of this chapter is weakened, I think, by the long account of the history of electric traction before 1892. Could not this earlier part of the story be worked into an earlier chapter, possibly Chapter IV?

AMS.

Digital Image, 2011. The Ida M. Tarbell Collection, 1890-1944, Allegheny College Pelletier Library.

Chapter XIII

Dear Miss Tarbell:

I think the presentation of your material would be very much more effective if the free silver discussion in Chapter XIII should be kept to itself and at the chapter, thus shortened, should precede Chapter XII.

This would allow you to devote the new Chapter XIII to the recuperative economic forces in the 1890s. The new chapter would include what you now have in old Chapter XII and, in addition, your accounts of the Dingley Tariff, the later trust development and the Spanish-American War. This would give the treatment real unity and give the narrative part of your volume an impressive concluding chapter.

In your discussion of the silver movement, you need to say something about the subsidence of the demand after 1896. The best statement of the reasons that I know is the brief statement in L. M. Hacker and B. B. Kendrick, The United States since 1865, 318-320. ①

If I may add one further comment, I wondered a bit at your inclusion of Flint's relationship to trust development at this late place in your book. Might it not come better earlier, perhaps in Chapter III?

A. M. S.

① I note that in Chap. XIV, 436-437, you discuss the status of the farmer after 1896. You do not, however, touch upon the very interesting reasons which Hacker and Kendrick give for the deflation of the silver movement, and which I hint at in the Rise of the City, 427-428, with cross-reference to your volume.

P. 423 of Ms. War was declared but a more sentimental element in securing war & repeal in 1892 & 98 & the clergy came of very at the age of each period cit-p
In. Cen. XIX. p 304 ff