By Caroline Hunt Fitchcock

A FEW OF THE "PROOFS"
THAT ALL OTHER HISTORIANS ARE WRONG
ALSO
MOST OF THE OLD FRIENDS OF THE FAMILY OF
ABRAHAM LINCOLN

Digital Image, 2009. The Ida M. Tarbell Collection, 1890-1944, Allegheny College Pelletier Library

ALL THE HISTORIANS IN ERROR

Lea Hutchinson

Page 9

"We depart from the chronology of Lea Hutchinson in their handsome volume of the ancestry of Lincoln which since 1909 has furnished most biographers with their data.

"Of that book it is high praise to say that it is not always wrong.

"For the most part it is to be rejected.

"That book furnished the materials for the inscription upon the walls of the memorial at Hodginsville and these inscriptions are sadly inaccurate."

Page 21

"Lea Hutchinson have not established....the English ancestry... "With the family in America and in their American line I have found them to be so often in error that I no longer trust them in any matter..."

Page 25

"It is upon their authority that the bust (of Lincoln) was erected in Hingham England. Waldo Lincoln is skeptical about it...I should be more glad tobelieve that Lea Hutchinson were right in this particular, because I have found them wrong in so many other matters."

Page 35

"Of the Hankses he knew little except what he learned from Mrs. Hitchcock...

Digital Image, 2009. The Ida M. Tarbell Collection, 1890-1944, Allegheny College Pelletier Library

John Drinkwater

Page 323

"A play entitled 'Abraham Lincoln' by John Drinkwater is wrong in all its details"

IDA MINERVA TARBELL

Page 17

"Miss Tarbell has not assisted us in her wide spread publication of Dr. Graham's story...None of the things Christopher Columbus Graham tells of Jesse Head are true. Miss Tarbell's friends were not satisfied with Dr. Graham's story, but added a forged certificate of the marriage of Thomas and Nancy separate from the marriage return. Miss Tarbell was imposed upon by people whom she trusted.... This fraudulent certificate..... appears in Miss Tarbell's early life of Lincoln.

Page 56

Both Lea and Hutchinson and Miss Tarbell are guiltless of intentional wrong and I do not think Mrs. Hitchcock invented it."

Norman Hapgood

Page 22

"Norman Hapgood in his "Abraham Lincoln"...a book written with fine disregard of fact"

Henry C. Whitney

Page 360

"Opinions differ as to the accuracy of Whitney's report of 'The Lost Speech'."

Digital Image, 2009. The Ida M. Tarbell Collection, 1890-1944, Allegheny College Pelletier Library

Dwight L. Moody and Bishop Cheney

Page 85

"Dwight L. Moody and Bishop Cheney were both mistaken.. We separate with some difficulty the kernals...from their husks of exaggeration and misrepresentation."

J. Rogers Gore

Page 82

" 'The Boyhood of Lincoln'....by J. Rogers Gore... This book belongs to the class of highly imaginative fiction rather than history."

L.E.Chittenden

Page 150

"While in ordinary matters a truthful man he was a very unreliable historian...

"Not that Mr. Chittenden was the greatest liar in Washington. He was not. But he was one of the many men who colored their memories with their imagination until their accounts became wholly unsafe as historical data"

Page 252

"A truthful but very inaccurate historian"

Waldo Lincoln

Page 57

"Even Waldo Lincoln in his recent book tells us that 'Dennis Hanks appears to have gone out of his way to calumniate both Nancy and her husband' I find no evidence of this.

Digital Image, 2009. The Ida M. Tarbell Collection, 1890-1944, Allegheny College Pelletier Library

Page 34

"Waldo Lincoln relying upon the Hall tradition..held there were two marriages.."

....My discoveries completely revolutionize all these theories."

Caroline Hanks Hitchcock

Page 37

"The Hanks family is not so bad as Horndon affirms nor so illustrious as Mrs. Hitchcock...if the tomb of Tut-ankh-amen had been discovered when she wrote she must surely have acclaimed his middle name...As she traced the triumphal march on this regal clan...

Page 38

"A son of each of these five families..rode past the homes of all the girls residing in nearer neighborhoods and each made love to a daughter of Richard Shipley".

Page 39

"Mr. Shipley may have had five daughters or even ten five of them wise and five amateur genealogists but thus far not a scrap of evidence has been adduced to prove that he had even one little ewe lamb of a daughter"

Page 44

"The Hanks family are very good people. I venture the opinion that in matters relating to their family history...they obtained more information from Mrs. Hitchcock such as it was than they were able to give her."

Digital Image, 2009. The Ida M. Tarbell Collection, 1890-1944, Allegheny College Pelletier Library

"For a chunk of an old horse that would of traded for about $15. this is the lordly domain about which Mrs. Hitchcock writes, where the Hankses and their illustrious cousins went merrily hunting and fishing and hawking in right royal fashion."

Page 53

"Miss Tarbell in her introduction proclaimed that Mrs. Hitchcock had forever removed the stain wicked men had cast upon the lineage of Lincoln's mother...She did not possess in 1899 a genealogy." (It was finished then)

Page 56

"I do not think Mrs. Hitchcock invented it..but this I know, and the knowledge has cost me much labor that this fabric (the true story of Nancy Hanks the mother of Abraham Lincoln)...could not have originated innocently."

Page 62

"This is not as pretty a story (Barton's unwarranted falsehoods about the grandmother Lucy) as that told by Mrs. Hitchcock and the rest."

Weem's Life of Washington

Page 121

"It has no great merit...Lincoln read this pompous and highly colored book.."

Digital Image, 2009. The Ida M. Tarbell Collection, 1890-1944, Allegheny College Pelletier Library

J. B. Helm

Page 16

"Mr. J. B. Helm whose memory was at fault in other matters...may have been in this...(The disgraceful campmeeting story which Barton has repeated in his various books at least seven times)...old men do not recall incidents lain buried for fifty-nine years"

Austin Gallagher

Page 78

"He gained considerable celebrity in his old age by claiming to have saved the life of Abraham Lincoln...But Dennis claimed to have performed the same brave deed....one has frequent occasions to recall the comment of Falstaff on the lack of veracity in old men."
(Barton quotes things Dennis said after he was ninety and Barton himself is over eighty)

Christopher Columbus Graham

Page 17

"Dr. Graham in his garralous romancing...none of the things he tells of Jesse Head are true...Wm. Hardesty's evidence is much better than Dr. Graham's which is worthless."

Rev. David Elkins

Page 117

"He was uncultivated being barely able to read...very indolent and slovenly"

Digital Image, 2009. The Ida M. Tarbell Collection, 1890-1944, Allegheny College Pelletier Library

Stephen A. Douglas

Page 477

"He had a berth in a sleeping car...Also a bottle of liquor...lying in his berth half awake and less than half sober....he burst into uproreous laughter"

Col. R. G. Durrett

Page 28

"He located Hughes Station at the mouth of Long Run,.. He was mistaken.."

Wm. Lloyd Garrison - Wendall Phillips -Andrew Jackson

Page 54

"Extreme abolishionists like Wm. Lloyd Garrison and Wendall Phillips insistently denounced the union....Andrew Jackson died regretting that he had never been able to shoot Henry Clay or to hang Calhoun"

Joseph Howard of the New York Times and New York Tribune

Page 287

"The author of the forgery was Joseph Howard who had been city editor of the N. Y. Tribune. He was a member of the Plymouth Church and had reported sermons of Henry Ward Beecher."

The Perfect Tribute

Page 210

"Purported to give the story of Lincoln's Gettysburg Speech..is totally at variance with the facts."

Digital Image, 2009. The Ida M. Tarbell Collection, 1890-1944, Allegheny College Pelletier Library

OTHERS WHO ARE WRONG

Hon. J. L. Nall

Page 27

"Hon. J. L. Nall...accepted the name Mary Shipley as... that of his great grandmother...Nicholay and Hay adopted Mr. Nall's view"....They were wrong....

Page 31

"It comes direct from Hon. J. L. Nall..of Carthage, Mo., grandson of Nancy Lincoln...claimed to have been derived from what he had heard from his mother through her grandmother, the widow of the pioneer Abraham Lincoln. But Mr. Nall was incorrect in this and in very much besides."

Rev. Louis A. Warren

Page 30

"Mr. Warren thinks that Abraham Lincoln died possessed of 5468 acres...I have not found so large a total.."

(To Mr. Warren Barton was indebted for his Kentucky information)

Digital Image, 2009. The Ida M. Tarbell Collection, 1890-1944, Allegheny College Pelletier Library